Preparing Peer-Review Worksheets: Sample Prompts that Can Encourage “Readerly” Feedback

General
What are 3 strengths of this paper?
What are 3 weak points?
Which paragraph is the strongest? Why?
Which paragraph is the weakest? Why?
If there are points at which you “stumbled,” or had to re-read a sentence several times to try to discern its meaning, identify at least one of these sentences for the writer.
Which of the paper’s transitions help you follow the “flow” of the paper? Which of the transitions are either missing or not helpful?
What does the writer do in the conclusion? E.g. Summarize points already made? Reflect on implications? Introduce a new idea? How does this concluding strategy affect you as a reader?
What questions do you have for the writer?
What has this paper taught you about what you should do, or shouldn’t do, in your own paper?

Thesis-Driven Essay
Restate the thesis in your own words. If you are having trouble identifying a thesis, please explain why.
What position is the writer taking in this paper? What is the writer’s argument?
List the paper’s three most important pieces of evidence or support. Which of these points is most convincing and which is least convincing? Why?
As you think about the paper’s overall argument, has the writer convinced you that it is a logical and reasonable argument? Why or why not?

Scientific Paper
What is the research question that the paper presents?
Why is this question important?
Consider the “Methods” section. Which of the methods are clear to you, and which are not yet clear?
What are the 2-3 most important pieces of data described in the “Results”?
What is the paper’s conclusion?
If there are results, or data, that are not adequately addressed by the paper’s conclusion, point these out to the writer and explain why you think these results or data are not adequately addressed.

© 2009, The Teaching Center, Washington University